

Critical Speed of a Dual Rotor System

Introduction

Dual shaft systems with intershaft bearings are becoming a standard configuration for gas turbine engines, where high power output is required. These systems consist of two coaxial rotors (shafts) running at different speeds, and interlinked through a multi-spool bearing. In this example, an eigenfrequency analysis is performed for such a dual rotor system to determine critical speeds. Cross exciting vibrations through the multi-spool bearing couple the dynamic behavior of the two rotors.

Model Definition

The model consists of two coaxial rotors connected through an intershaft bearing. The solid inner rotor is supported by bearings at both ends, at station 1 and station 6. The left end of the hollow outer rotor (station 7) is supported by a bearing. At the right end of the outer rotor (station 10), a multi-spool bearing provides mutual support between the inner and outer rotors. The rotor configuration is shown in Figure 1.



Figure 1: Rotor configuration.

Two disks are mounted on the inner rotor, at station 2 and station 5, and two disks are also mounted on the outer rotor, at station 8 and station 9. The positions of the stations, with station 1 as reference, are given in Table 2.

S.

STATION	POSITION
Ι	0 cm
2	7.62 cm
3	25.4 cm
4	40.64 cm

TABLE I: POSITIONS OF THE STATIONS.

STATION	POSITION
5	45.72 cm
6	50.8 cm
7	15.24 cm
8	20.32 cm
9	35.56 cm
10	40.64 cm

The properties for the rotors are given in the Table 2.

TABLE 2:	PROPERTIES	OF THE	ROTORS.

PROPERTY	VALUE
Density ρ	8304 kg/m ³
Young's modulus E	206.9 GPa
Poisson's ratio v	0.3
Inner rotor radius r _I	1.52 cm
Outer rotor inner radius r _{2i}	1.905 cm
Outer rotor outer radius r ₂₀	2.54 cm

The properties of the mounted disks are given in the Table 3.

TABLE 3: PROPERTIES OF THE DISKS.

STATION	MASS	POLAR MOMENT OF INERTIA	DIAMETRAL MOMENT OF INERTIA
2	4.904 kg	0.02712 kg/m ²	0.01356 kg/m ²
5	4.203 kg	0.02034 kg/m ²	0.01017 kg/m ²
8	3.327 kg	0.01469 kg/m ²	0.007345 kg/m ²
9	2.227 kg	0.00972 kg/m ²	0.00486 kg/m ²

All the bearings are isotropic. The stiffnesses of the bearings at different stations are given in Table 4.

TABLE 4: BEARING STIFFNESS.

STATION	STIFFNESS
I	27.95 MN/m
4–10	8.7598 MN/m
6	17.519 MN/m
7	17.519 MN/m

Results and Discussion

Figure 2 shows the whirl plot for the first mode (backward whirl, f = 70.066 Hz) at 25,000 rpm. To relate this plot to the rotor system, the rotors, bearings and disks are shown beneath it.

fr(26)=25000 rpm Eigenfrequency=70.066 Hz Whirl: Displacement field Whirl: Displacement field



Figure 2: Whirl plot for the first mode.



Whirl plots for other modes are shown in Figure 3. The figure shows that the inner rotor exhibits bending modes, while the outer rotor exhibits rigid body modes.

Figure 3: Mode shapes for different frequencies.

A Campbell plot for the dual rotor system is shown in Figure 4. The two lines Ω_1 and Ω_2 represent the speeds of rotors 1 and 2 (inner and outer rotors), and the dashed and dotted blue lines represent natural frequencies due to forward and backward whirl, respectively. The critical speeds of the inner rotor are compared in Table 5 to critical speeds of Ref. 1.

MODE	COMSOL (RAD/S)	REF. I (RAD/S)
First (backward)	658	660
First (forward)	866	863
Second (backward)	1430	1423
Second (forward)	1612	1606
Third (backward)(2120	2125
Third (forward)	2280	2283

TABLE 5: COMPARISON OF CRITICAL SPEEDS FOR THE INNER ROTOR.



Figure 4: Campbell plot for the rotor system.

The critical speeds of the outer rotor are compared in Table 6 to critical speeds of Ref. 1...

MODE	COMSOL (RAD/S)	REF. I (RAD/S)
First (backward)	685	687
First (forward)	823	822
Second (backward)	1468	1462
Second (forward)	1589	1584
Third (backward)	2172	2175
Third (forward)	2279	2274

TABLE 6: COMPARISON OF CRITICAL SPEEDS FOR THE OUTER ROTOR.

Reference

1. J.S. Rao., *Rotor Dynamics*, example 8.11, pp. 266–269, New Age International (P) Limited, 2014.

Application Library path: Rotordynamics_Module/Verification_Examples/ dual_rotors

Modeling Instructions

From the File menu, choose New.

NEW

In the New window, click 🙆 Model Wizard.

MODEL WIZARD

- I In the Model Wizard window, click 间 3D.
- 2 In the Select Physics tree, select Structural Mechanics>Rotordynamics> Beam Rotor (rotbm).
- 3 Click Add.
- 4 Click \bigcirc Study.
- 5 In the Select Study tree, select General Studies>Eigenfrequency.
- 6 Click 🗹 Done.

Create a list of parameters for the geometry of the rotors.

GLOBAL DEFINITIONS

Parameters: Geometry

- I In the Model Builder window, under Global Definitions click Parameters I.
- 2 In the Settings window for Parameters, type Parameters: Geometry in the Label text field.
- 3 Locate the Parameters section. In the table, enter the following settings:

Name	Expression	Value	Description
x1	0[cm]	0 m	Position of station 1
x2	7.62[cm]	0.0762 m	Position of station 2
x3	25.4[cm]	0.254 m	Position of station 3
x4	40.64[cm]	0.4064 m	Position of station 4
x5	45.72[cm]	0.4572 m	Position of station 5

Name	Expression	Value	Description
x6	50.8[cm]	0.508 m	Position of station 6
x7	15.24[cm]	0.1524 m	Position of station 7
x8	20.32[cm]	0.2032 m	Position of station 8
x9	35.56[cm]	0.3556 m	Position of station 9
x10	40.64[cm]	0.4064 m	Position of station 10
r1	1.52[cm]	0.0152 m	Radius of the inner rotor
r2i	1.905[cm]	0.01905 m	Inner radius of the outer rotor
r20	2.54[cm]	0.0254 m	Outer radius of the outer rotor

Create a list of parameters for the bearing properties.

Parameters: Bearing

- I In the Home toolbar, click P_i Parameters and choose Add>Parameters.
- **2** In the **Settings** window for **Parameters**, type **Parameters**: Bearing in the **Label** text field.
- 3 Locate the Parameters section. In the table, enter the following settings:

Name	Expression	Value	Description
k1	27.95e6[N/m]	2.795E7 N/m	Stiffness, bearing at station 1
k4	8.7598e6[N/m]	8.7598E6 N/m	Stiffness, bearing between stations 4 and 10
k6	17.519e6[N/m]	1.7519E7 N/m	Stiffness, bearing at station 6
k7	17.519e6[N/m]	1.7519E7 N/m	Stiffness, bearing at station 7

Create a list of parameters for the material properties.

Parameters: Material

- I In the Home toolbar, click Pi Parameters and choose Add>Parameters.
- **2** In the **Settings** window for **Parameters**, type **Parameters**: Material in the **Label** text field.

Name	Expression	Value	Description
Es	206.9[GPa]	2.069E11 Pa	Young's modulus of the rotors
rhos	8304[kg/m^3]	8304 kg/m ³	Density of the rotors
nus	0.3	0.3	Poisson's ratio of the rotors
m2	4.904[kg]	4.904 kg	Mass at station 2
m5	4.203[kg]	4.203 kg	Mass at station 5
m8	3.327[kg]	3.327 kg	Mass at station 8
m9	2.227[kg]	2.227 kg	Mass at station 9
Ip2	0.02712[kg*m^2]	0.02712 kg·m²	Polar moment of inertia at station 2
Ip5	0.02034[kg*m^2]	0.02034 kg·m²	Polar moment of inertia at station 5
Ip8	0.01469[kg*m^2]	0.01469 kg·m²	Polar moment of inertia at station 8
Ip9	0.00972[kg*m^2]	0.00972 kg·m²	Polar moment of inertia at station 9
Id2	Ip2/2	0.01356 kg·m²	Diametral moment of inertia at station 2
Id5	Ip5/2	0.01017 kg·m²	Diametral moment of inerta at station 5
Id8	Ip8/2	0.007345 kg·m²	Diametral moment of inertia at station 8
Id9	Ip9/2	0.00486 kg·m²	Diametral moment of inertia at station 9

3 Locate the **Parameters** section. In the table, enter the following settings:

Finally, create a list of parameters for the angular speeds of the rotors.

Parameters: Angular speed

- I In the Home toolbar, click Pi Parameters and choose Add>Parameters.
- 2 In the Settings window for Parameters, type Parameters: Angular speed in the Label text field.

Name	Expression	Value	Description
fr	1000[rpm]	16.667 1/s	Angular speed of the inner rotor
fr2	1.5*fr	25 1/s	Angular speed of the outer rotor

3 Locate the **Parameters** section. In the table, enter the following settings:

Now, create the lines (polygons) representing the axles of the rotors. For coaxial rotors, these lines would overlap. Here, create the lines with an offset for clarity and to facilitate making selections for various features in the instructions that follow.

GEOMETRY I

Polygon I (poll)

I In the Geometry toolbar, click \bigoplus More Primitives and choose Polygon.

2 In the Settings window for Polygon, locate the Coordinates section.

3 In the table, enter the following settings:

x (m)	y (m)	z (m)
x1	0	0
x2	0	0
x3	0	0
x4	0	0
x5	0	0
x6	0	0

Add the selection as Inner Rotor for later use.

- **4** Locate the **Selections of Resulting Entities** section. Find the **Cumulative selection** subsection. Click **New**.
- 5 In the New Cumulative Selection dialog box, type Inner Rotor in the Name text field.
- 6 Click OK.

Polygon 2 (pol2)

- I In the Geometry toolbar, click \bigoplus More Primitives and choose Polygon.
- 2 In the Settings window for Polygon, locate the Coordinates section.

3 In the table, enter the following settings:

x (m)	y (m)	z (m)
x7	0	6*r2o
x8	0	6*r2o
x9	0	6*r2o
x10	0	6*r2o

Add the selection as **Outer Rotor** for later use.

- **4** Locate the **Selections of Resulting Entities** section. Find the **Cumulative selection** subsection. Click **New**.
- 5 In the New Cumulative Selection dialog box, type Outer Rotor in the Name text field.
- 6 Click OK.
- 7 In the Settings window for Polygon, click 🟢 Build All Objects.

MATERIALS

Material I (mat1)

- I In the Model Builder window, under Component I (compl) right-click Materials and choose Blank Material.
- 2 In the Settings window for Material, locate the Material Contents section.
- **3** In the table, enter the following settings:

Property	Variable	Value	Unit	Property group
Young's modulus	E	Es	Pa	Basic
Poisson's ratio	nu	nus	1	Basic
Density	rho	rhos	kg/m³	Basic

BEAM ROTOR (ROTBM)

- I In the Model Builder window, under Component I (compl) click Beam Rotor (rotbm).
- 2 In the Settings window for Beam Rotor, locate the Rotor Speed section.
- **3** In the text field, type fr.

Rotor Cross Section 1

- I In the Model Builder window, under Component I (compl)>Beam Rotor (rotbm) click Rotor Cross Section I.
- 2 In the Settings window for Rotor Cross Section, locate the Cross-Section Definition section.

3 In the d_o text field, type 2*r1.

Rotor Cross Section 2

- I In the Physics toolbar, click 🗁 Edges and choose Rotor Cross Section.
- 2 In the Settings window for Rotor Cross Section, locate the Edge Selection section.
- **3** From the **Selection** list, choose **Outer Rotor**.
- 4 Locate the Cross-Section Definition section. From the Section type list, choose Pipe.
- **5** In the d_o text field, type 2*r20.
- **6** In the d_i text field, type 2*r2i.

Change Rotor Speed I

- I In the Physics toolbar, click 📄 Edges and choose Change Rotor Speed.
- 2 In the Settings window for Change Rotor Speed, locate the Edge Selection section.
- 3 From the Selection list, choose Outer Rotor.
- **4** Locate the **Rotor Speed** section. In the text field, type fr2.

Disk I

- I In the Physics toolbar, click 🗁 Points and choose Disk.
- 2 Select Point 2 only.
- 3 In the Settings window for Disk, locate the Disk Properties section.
- 4 In the *m* text field, type m2.
- **5** In the I_p text field, type Ip2.
- **6** In the I_d text field, type Id2.

Disk 2

- I In the Physics toolbar, click 📄 Points and choose Disk.
- 2 Select Point 9 only.
- 3 In the Settings window for Disk, locate the Disk Properties section.
- 4 In the *m* text field, type m5.
- **5** In the I_p text field, type Ip5.
- **6** In the I_d text field, type Id5.

Disk 3

- I In the Physics toolbar, click 🗁 Points and choose Disk.
- 2 Select Point 4 only.
- 3 In the Settings window for Disk, locate the Disk Properties section.

- 4 In the *m* text field, type m8.
- **5** In the I_p text field, type Ip8.
- **6** In the I_d text field, type Id8.

Disk 4

- I In the Physics toolbar, click 🗁 Points and choose Disk.
- 2 Select Point 6 only.
- 3 In the Settings window for Disk, locate the Disk Properties section.
- 4 In the *m* text field, type m9.
- **5** In the I_p text field, type Ip9.
- **6** In the I_d text field, type Id9.

Journal Bearing 1

- I In the Physics toolbar, click 📄 Points and choose Journal Bearing.
- 2 Select Point 1 only.
- 3 In the Settings window for Journal Bearing, locate the Bearing Properties section.
- 4 From the Bearing model list, choose Total spring and damping constant.
- **5** In the \mathbf{k}_u table, enter the following settings:

k1	0
0	k1

Multi-Spool Bearing I

- I In the Physics toolbar, click 🗁 Points and choose Multi-Spool Bearing.
- 2 Select Point 7 only.
- **3** In the **Settings** window for **Multi-Spool Bearing**, locate the **Destination Point Selection** section.
- **4** Select the **Image Activate Selection** toggle button.
- 5 Select Point 8 only.
- 6 Locate the Bearing Properties section. From the Displacement connection list, choose Flexible.
- 7 In the \mathbf{k}_u table, enter the following settings:

k4	0
0	k4

Journal Bearing 2

- I In the Physics toolbar, click 🔚 Points and choose Journal Bearing.
- 2 Select Point 10 only.
- 3 In the Settings window for Journal Bearing, locate the Bearing Properties section.
- 4 From the Bearing model list, choose Total spring and damping constant.
- **5** In the \mathbf{k}_{μ} table, enter the following settings:

k6	0
0	k6

Journal Bearing 3

I In the Physics toolbar, click 📄 Points and choose Journal Bearing.

- **2** Select Point 3 only.
- 3 In the Settings window for Journal Bearing, locate the Bearing Properties section.
- 4 From the Bearing model list, choose Total spring and damping constant.
- **5** In the \mathbf{k}_u table, enter the following settings:

k7	0
0	k7

STUDY I

Parametric Sweep

- I In the Study toolbar, click **Parametric Sweep**.
- 2 In the Settings window for Parametric Sweep, locate the Study Settings section.
- 3 Click + Add.
- **4** In the table, enter the following settings:

Parameter name	Parameter value list	Parameter unit
fr (Angular speed of the inner	range(0,1000,25000)	rpm
rotor)		

Step 1: Eigenfrequency

- I In the Model Builder window, click Step I: Eigenfrequency.
- 2 In the Settings window for Eigenfrequency, locate the Study Settings section.
- **3** Select the **Desired number of eigenfrequencies** check box.
- 4 In the associated text field, type 8.

5 In the **Study** toolbar, click **= Compute**.

A result parameter **scale** is used to create and offset between the undeformed geometry and the whirl plot. Increase the value to make them sufficiently separated.

RESULTS

Parameters

- I In the Model Builder window, under Results click Parameters.
- 2 In the Settings window for Parameters, locate the Parameters section.
- **3** In the table, enter the following settings:

Name	Expression	Value	Description
scale	1.4	1.4	

The default whirl plot is shown in Figure 2.

Whirl (rotbm)

- I In the Model Builder window, click Whirl (rotbm).
- 2 In the Settings window for 3D Plot Group, locate the Plot Settings section.
- 3 From the View list, choose New view.
- 4 Click the **Click the** 4 Zoom Extents button in the Graphics toolbar.
- 5 In the Whirl (rotbm) toolbar, click **O** Plot.

Now, disable the nodes corresponding to the geometry in the **Whirl Plot** group to plot only the mode shapes. These plots are shown in Figure 3.

6 In the Model Builder window, expand the Whirl (rotbm) node.

Disk 1, Disk 2, Disk 3, Disk 4, Journal Bearing 1, Journal Bearing 2, Journal Bearing 3, Rotor

- In the Model Builder window, under Results>Whirl (rotbm), Ctrl-click to select Rotor, Disk 1, Disk 2, Disk 3, Disk 4, Journal Bearing 1, Journal Bearing 2, and Journal Bearing 3.
- 2 Right-click and choose Disable.

Whirl (rotbm)

- I In the Model Builder window, click Whirl (rotbm).
- 2 In the Settings window for 3D Plot Group, locate the Data section.
- 3 From the Eigenfrequency (Hz) list, choose 169.95.
- **4** Click the 4 **Zoom Extents** button in the **Graphics** toolbar.

- 5 In the Whirl (rotbm) toolbar, click **I** Plot.
- 6 From the Eigenfrequency (Hz) list, choose 261.64.
- 7 In the Whirl (rotbm) toolbar, click **9** Plot.
- 8 From the Eigenfrequency (Hz) list, choose 344.96.
- 9 In the Whirl (rotbm) toolbar, click 🗿 Plot.

IO From the Eigenfrequency (Hz) list, choose 387.04.

II In the Whirl (rotbm) toolbar, click **I** Plot.

You can now enable the nodes corresponding to the geometry to revert the plot to the default state.

Disk 1, Disk 2, Disk 3, Disk 4, Journal Bearing 1, Journal Bearing 2, Journal Bearing 3, Rotor

- In the Model Builder window, under Results>Whirl (rotbm), Ctrl-click to select Rotor, Disk 1, Disk 2, Disk 3, Disk 4, Journal Bearing 1, Journal Bearing 2, and Journal Bearing 3.
- 2 Right-click and choose **Enable**.

Whirl (rotbm)

Click the **Zoom Extents** button in the **Graphics** toolbar.

The default Campbell plot only shows the $\omega = \Omega$ curve for the primary rotor (inner rotor). Duplicate the corresponding node to add a similar curve for the outer rotor. The Campbell plot is shown in Figure 4.

Campbell Plot (rotbm)

- I In the Model Builder window, click Campbell Plot (rotbm).
- 2 In the Settings window for ID Plot Group, locate the Plot Settings section.
- 3 Select the x-axis label check box.
- 4 In the associated text field, type Rotor speed (rad/s).

omega=Omega I

- I In the Model Builder window, expand the Campbell Plot (rotbm) node.
- 2 Right-click omega=Omega and choose Duplicate.
- 3 In the Settings window for Global, locate the y-Axis Data section.
- **4** In the table, enter the following settings:

Expression	Unit	Description
if(rotbm.0vg<=0.8*rotbm.omega,2*pi[rad]*fr2,		
NaN)		

Annotation I

- I In the Model Builder window, click Annotation I.
- 2 In the Settings window for Annotation, locate the Annotation section.
- **3** In the **Text** text field, type \[\omega=\Omega_1\].

Annotation 2

- I Right-click Results>Campbell Plot (rotbm)>Annotation I and choose Duplicate.
- 2 In the Settings window for Annotation, locate the Annotation section.
- **3** In the **Text** text field, type \[\omega=\Omega_2\].
- 4 Locate the **Position** section. In the **Y** text field, type 0.5*rotbm.0vg*1.5.

Campbell Plot (rotbm)

- I In the Model Builder window, click Campbell Plot (rotbm).
- 2 In the Campbell Plot (rotbm) toolbar, click **O** Plot.

Whirl (rotbm)

Click the 4 **Zoom Extents** button in the **Graphics** toolbar.